

# **STANISLAUS-CERES REDEVELOPMENT COMMISSION**

## **ASSET TRANSFER REVIEW**

### Review Report

*January 1, 2011, through January 31, 2012*



**JOHN CHIANG**  
California State Controller

March 2014



**JOHN CHIANG**  
**California State Controller**

March 28, 2014

Art de Werk, City Manager  
City of Ceres/Stanislaus-Ceres  
Redevelopment Commission  
2720 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
Ceres, CA 95307

Dear Mr. de Werk:

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 34167.5, the State Controller's Office (SCO) reviewed all asset transfers made by the Stanislaus-Ceres Redevelopment Commission (RDA) to the City of Ceres (City) or any other public agency after January 1, 2011. This statutory provision states, "The Legislature hereby finds that a transfer of assets by a redevelopment agency during the period covered in this section is deemed not to be in furtherance of the Community Redevelopment Law and is thereby unauthorized." Therefore, our review included an assessment of whether each asset transfer was allowable and whether the asset should be turned over to the Successor Agency.

Our review applied to all assets including but not limited to, real and personal property, cash funds, accounts receivable, deeds of trust and mortgages, contract rights, and rights to payment of any kind. We also reviewed and determined whether any unallowable transfers of assets to the City or any other public agencies have been reversed.

Our review found that the RDA transferred \$1,883,957 in assets after January 1, 2011, to the Successor Agency. We did not identify any unallowable transfers of assets that occurred during the review period between the RDA, the City, and/or other public agencies.

If you have any questions, please contact Elizabeth Gonzalez, Bureau Chief, Local Government Compliance Bureau, by phone at (916) 324-0622.

Sincerely,

*Original signed by*

**JEFFREY V. BROWNFIELD, CPA**  
Chief, Division of Audits

JVB/sk

cc: Sheila Cumberland, Deputy City Manager  
City of Ceres/Stanslaus-Ceres Redevelopment Commission  
David Botelho, Program Budget Manager  
California Department of Finance  
Richard J. Chivaro, Chief Legal Counsel  
State Controller's Office  
Elizabeth Gonzalez, Bureau Chief  
Division of Audits, State Controller's Office  
Betty Moya, Audit Manager  
Division of Audits, State Controller's Office  
Nesha Neycheva, Auditor-in-Charge  
Division of Audits, State Controller's Office  
Matthew Rios, Audit Staff  
Division of Audits, State Controller's Office

# Contents

## Review Report

<b>Summary</b> .....	1
<b>Background</b> .....	1
<b>Objective, Scope, and Methodology</b> .....	2
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	2
<b>Views of Responsible Official</b> .....	2
<b>Restricted Use</b> .....	2

# Asset Transfer Review Report

## Summary

The State Controller's Office (SCO) reviewed the asset transfers made by the Stanislaus-Ceres Redevelopment Commission Redevelopment Agency (RDA) after January 1, 2011. Our review included, but was not limited to, real and personal property, cash funds, accounts receivable, deeds of trust and mortgages, contract rights, and rights to payments of any kind from any source.

Our review found that the RDA transferred \$1,883,957 in assets after January 1, 2011, to the Successor Agency. We did not identify any unallowable transfers of assets that occurred during the review period between the RDA, the City of Ceres (City), and/or other public agencies.

## Background

In January of 2011, the Governor of the State of California proposed statewide elimination of redevelopment agencies (RDAs) beginning with the fiscal year (FY) 2011-12 State budget. The Governor's proposal was incorporated into Assembly Bill 26 (ABX1 26, Chapter 5, Statutes of 2011, First Extraordinary Session), which was passed by the Legislature, and signed into law by the Governor on June 28, 2011.

ABX1 26 prohibited RDAs from engaging in new business, established mechanisms and timelines for dissolution of the RDAs, and created RDA Successor Agencies to oversee dissolution of the RDAs and redistribution of RDA assets.

A California Supreme Court decision on December 28, 2011 (*California Redevelopment Association et al. v. Matosantos*), upheld ABX1 26 and the Legislature's constitutional authority to dissolve the RDAs.

ABX1 26 was codified in the Health and Safety Code (H&S Code) beginning with section 34161.

In accordance with the requirements of H&S Code section 34167.5, the State Controller is required to review the activities of RDAs, "to determine whether an asset transfer has occurred after January 1, 2011, between the city or county, or city and county that created a redevelopment agency, or any other public agency, and the redevelopment agency," and the date on which the RDA ceases to operate, or January 31, 2012, whichever is earlier.

The SCO identified asset transfers that occurred after January 1, 2011, between the RDA, the City, and/or other public agencies. By law, the SCO is required to order that such assets, except those that already had been committed to a third party prior to June 28, 2011, the effective date of ABX1 26, be turned over to the Successor Agency. In addition, the SCO may file a legal order to ensure compliance with this order.

**Objective, Scope,  
and Methodology**

Our review objective was to determine whether asset transfers that occurred after January 1, 2011, and the date upon which the RDA ceased to operate, or January 31, 2012, whichever was earlier, between the city or county, or city and county that created an RDA, or any other public agency, and the RDA, were appropriate.

We performed the following procedures:

- Interviewed Successor Agency personnel to gain an understanding of the Successor Agency operations and procedures.
- Reviewed meeting minutes, resolutions, and ordinances of the City, the RDA, and the Successor Agency.
- Reviewed accounting records relating to the recording of assets.
- Verified the accuracy of the Asset Transfer Assessment Form. This form was sent to all former RDAs to provide a list of all assets transferred between January 1, 2011, and January 31, 2012.
- Reviewed applicable financial reports to verify assets (capital, cash, property, etc.).

**Conclusion**

Our review found that the Stanislaus-Ceres Redevelopment Commission (RDA) appropriately transferred \$1,883,957 in assets after January 1, 2011, to the Successor Agency. We did not identify any unallowable transfers of assets that occurred during the review period between the RDA, the City of Ceres, and/or other public agencies.

**Views of  
Responsible  
Official**

At an exit conference on January 10, 2014, we discussed the review results with Sheila Cumberland, Deputy City Manager, who agreed with the review results. Ms. Cumberland further agreed that a draft review report was not necessary and that the report could be issued as final.

**Restricted Use**

This report is solely for the information and use of the City, the Successor Agency, the Oversight Board, and the SCO; it is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties. This restriction is not intended to limit distribution of this report, which is a matter of public record when issued final.

*Original signed by*

JEFFREY V. BROWNFIELD, CPA  
Chief, Division of Audits

March 28, 2014

**State Controller's Office  
Division of Audits  
Post Office Box 942850  
Sacramento, CA 94250-5874**

**<http://www.sco.ca.gov>**